

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

#### *BACKGROUND*

Education is the first step for any nation towards success. Education in the largest sense is any act or experience that has a formative effect on the mind, character or physical ability of an individual. The importance of Education is basically for two reasons. One, the training of a human mind is not complete without education. Education makes a man a right thinker. It tells man how to think and how to make decision.

Inclusive education is the process to remove all barriers and enable all students including the excluded groups, so that they can learn and participate effectively within the regular school systems. Inclusive education is different from the concepts of 'integration' and 'mainstreaming'. These concepts were more related to disabled and persons with special educational needs.

Inclusion talks about the child's right to participate and the school's duty to accept the child. Inclusion rejects the idea of special schools or classrooms which separate students with disabilities from students without disabilities.

In case of Inclusive Education for the Disabled Children, the NGOs are of the view that the government's goal of education for all cannot be achieved when the government has no defined policy for the 10 percent of children with mild and severe disabilities. NGOs, in the implementation of Inclusive Education for Disabled Children are facing numerous issues. Government's goal of education for all cannot be achieved when the government has no defined policy for the 10 percent of children with mild and severe disabilities. According to Save the Children, a

foundation that works for deprived and neglected children, "Disabled children living in institutions are particularly vulnerable to neglect, and to physical and sexual abuse. Those children who are totally dependent on caregivers in daily life will be most at risk-the very young and female disabled children, in particular. When abuse takes place, children isolated in insolated in institutions have no one to help them complain or defend themselves" (Save the Children, 2002). Such negative experience demands the need for including children with special needs in ordinary schools where children can live with their families.

## Education

The word education is derived from a Latin word, *educare* meaning "to bring up", which is related to *educere* meaning "to bring out", "bring forth what is within", "bring out potential" and "to lead". (Etymonline.com)

Education is the process by which knowledge, skills and values are transmitted from one generation to another. Education has a formative and constructive effect on the human mind.

The process of schooling involves getting educated on the subjects of Mathematics, Science, History, Reading and Writing. This process is also known as "Formal Education".

There are also other different fields of Education coming in the category of "Informal Education". They include learning skills such as Fine Arts, Informal level education such as in museums, libraries, dispensaries.

## Importance of Education in Development of Children and Society

The ratio and seriousness of Educational problems are far greater in developing countries. Usually the people in remote and agrarian areas are less aware of the importance of Education. Though, an emphasis on Education is a trend in most of the developing countries. People in the developing countries tend to be acquainted and fluent in foreign languages.

The educational material is being greatly influenced by the international environment. The concept of studying overseas, exchange student programs, working abroad is also playing an increasingly important role.

In Europe, for example, the Socrates-Erasmus Programme (Socrates-Erasmus Programme". Erasmus.ac.uk. <http://www.erasmus.ac.uk>. Retrieved 2010-06-19.) stimulates exchanges across European universities. Also, the Soros Foundation (Soros Foundation". Soros.org. <http://www.soros.org/>. Retrieved 2010-06-19.) provides many opportunities for students from central Asia and Eastern Europe. Programs such as the "International Baccalaureate" have contributed to the internationalization of education. Some scholars argue that, regardless of whether one system is considered better or worse than another, experiencing a different way of education can often be considered to be the most important, enriching element of an international learning experience. (Dubois, H. F. W., Padovano, G., & Stew, G. (2006) Improving international nurse training: an American-Italian case study. *International Nursing Review*, 53(2): 110-116.)

Universal primary education is one of the eight Millennium Development Goals and great improvements have been achieved in the past decade, yet a great deal remains to be done. Researchers at the Overseas Development Institute indicate the

main obstacles to greater funding from donors include: donor priorities, aid architecture, and the lack of evidence and advocacy. (Liesbet Steer and Geraldine Baudienville 2010. What drives donor financing of basic education? London: Overseas Development Institute). Additionally, Transparency International has identified corruption in the education sector as a major stumbling block to achieving Universal primary education in Africa.

([http://www.transparency.org/news\\_room/latest\\_news/press\\_releases/2010/2010\\_02\\_23\\_aew\\_launch\\_en](http://www.transparency.org/news_room/latest_news/press_releases/2010/2010_02_23_aew_launch_en))

### Importance of Education in Islam

Getting education is a sacred duty. It is obligatory on every Muslim, male and female. The first word revealed of the Quran was "Iqra" meaning "read", "educate yourselves and be educated". Surah Al-Zumr, ayah 9 reveals, "Are those equal, those who know and those who do not know?"

By virtue of such a fair educational program, the future generations will become the torch-bearers of Islamic values and play an effective role in the present world. The challenges faced by the Muslims in the current time calls for rebuilding the structure of our educational program. It should be based on such a foundation as to fulfill our spiritual as well as temporary obligations.

An uneducated person is someone who is walking along a track in complete darkness. Most likely his steps will wander aside and can be deceived easily. The acquiring of knowledge is worship. The practice of getting educated is connected with ethics and morality. Surah Al-Baqarah, ayah 269 reveals, "Allah grants

wisdom to whom He pleases and to whom wisdom is granted indeed he receives an overflowing benefit."

The following hadith shows the importance of education in Islam:

"He who acquires knowledge acquires a vast portion." AND "If anyone going on his way in search of knowledge, God will, thereby make easy for him the way to Paradise."

Every one of us, young or old, man or woman, should acquire sufficient education to enable ourselves to understand the world. In the Holy Qur'an, Allah S.W.T. says in Sura 2, verses 31-34:

"And he taught Adam all the names, then presented them to the angels; then He said: Tell me the names of those if you are right. They said: Glory be to thee! We have no knowledge but that which Thou hast taught us; surely Thou art the knowing, the wise. He said: O Adam! Inform them of their names. Then when he had informed them of their names, He said: Did I not say to you that I surely know what is ghaib in the heavens and the earth and (that) I know what you manifest and what you hide? And when We said to the angels: Make obeisance to Adam they did obeisance but Iblis (did it not). He refused and he was proud and he was one of the unbelievers."

Islam has always encouraged literacy and education. Throughout Quran, Allah has repeatedly emphasized on the importance of education. "God will exalt in degree those of you who believe, and those who have been granted knowledge." (Quran 58:11)

"And be not in haste (O Muhammad) with the Quran before its revelation is completed to you, and say, "My Lord! Increase me in knowledge." (Quran 20:114)

### Disability among Children in Pakistan

Disabled students have been either mainstreamed or segregated. A mainstreamed student is different from a segregated student. He attends the general education classes but they are academically less rigorous. For example, a student having intellectual disabilities is normally mainstreamed for Art classes and Physical Education Classes while he takes the other learning classes like Mathematics with students that have similar disabilities.

On the other hand, a segregated student does not attend any class with the regular non-disabled students. He or she if attends any school, that would be a special school.

### Inclusive Education

Inclusive education is the process to remove all barriers and enable all students including the excluded groups, so that they can learn and participate effectively within the regular school systems.

Inclusive education is different from the concepts of 'integration' and 'mainstreaming'. These concepts were more related to disabled and persons with special educational needs.

Inclusion talks about the child's right to participate and the school's duty to accept the child. Inclusion rejects the idea of special schools or classrooms which separate students with disabilities from students without disabilities.

Inclusive schools diminish the difference between "general education" and "special education" programs. An Inclusive Education School is a restructured school where all students can learn together.

The effects of Inclusive Education are positive and beneficial for both the students with special needs along with the other students in the classroom. Children with disabilities tend to benefit in communication, social skills and peer interactions. Research has also shown positive effects on children without disabilities. These include the development of positive attitudes. It also improves the perceptions of persons with disabilities.

Several studies have been done on the effects of inclusion of children with disabilities in general education classrooms. A study on inclusion compared integrated and segregated (special education only) preschool students. The study determined that children in the integrated sites progressed in social skills development while the segregated children actually regressed. (Sale, P., & Carey, D. 1995. The Sociometric status of students with disabilities in a full-inclusion school. *Exceptional Children*, 62.)

Another study shows the effect on inclusion in grades 2 to 5. The study determined that students with specific learning disabilities made some academic and affective gains at a pace comparable to that of normal achieving students. Specific learning disabilities students also showed an improvement in self-esteem and in some cases improved motivation. (Banerji, M., & Dailey, R. 1995. A Study of the effects of an inclusion model on students with specific learning disabilities. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 28(8), 511-522.)

Disabled students have been either mainstreamed or segregated. A mainstreamed student is different from a segregated student. He attends the general education classes but they are academically less rigorous. For example, a student having intellectual disabilities is normally mainstreamed for Art classes and Physical Education Classes while he takes the other learning classes like Mathematics with students that have similar disabilities.

On the other hand, a segregated student does not attend any class with the regular non-disabled students. He or she if attends any school, that would be a special school.

Inclusive Education depends upon the way teachers teach, rather the changes they make in their style of teaching. In addition to this, it also depends upon the changes in the behavior of regular students with the disabled ones.

Inclusion increases the disabled students' social importance. It is to be noted that everybody benefits from the inclusion practice. Disabled students when included with the regular education system at a very young age tend to face the challenges. There are increased compassion and leadership skills which can be beneficial to all the society. In addition, Inclusive Education can be advantageous to the all the students of the class. It helps students understand the value of working together. It also instills the concept of tolerance, empathy and team work.

#### Role of NGOs in the Inclusive Education of Disabled Children

In Pakistan, several NGOs are working for the rehabilitation, capacity building and development of the Disabled Children.

These NGOs have been established either by individuals with disability or are multinational NGOs. A study conducted by Nawaz and Raza (2002) found that NGOs provide a range of services to all who need them irrespective of gender, religion, ethnicity, race, disability or socio-cultural background. There is active coordination among them at the local level to pool their resources. NGOs were found to be flexible, and have great potential for starting inclusive education.

In case of Inclusive Education for the Disabled Children, the NGOs are of the view that the government's goal of education for all cannot be achieved when the government has no defined policy for the 10 percent of children with mild and severe disabilities. According to Save the Children - a foundation that works for deprived and neglected children, "Disabled children living in institutions are particularly vulnerable to neglect, and to physical and sexual abuse. Those children who are totally dependent on caregivers in daily life will be most at risk-the very young and female disabled children, in particular. When abuse takes place, children isolated in insolated in institutions have no one to help them complain or defend themselves" (Save the Children, 2002). Such negative experience demands the need for including children with special needs in ordinary schools where children can live with their families.

There are 106,275 primary schools in the public sector in Pakistan with 278,051 teachers (Bureau of Statistics, 1998). The Ministry of Education needs to make essential modifications to the environment of ordinary schools, tweak the curriculum for special needs, and train the teachers to build their capacity for undertaking the challenge of inclusive schooling. To achieve this, sufficient financial resources, new infrastructure and a

new vision of education is required, for all these are crucial elements of an operational system. There are organizations like The Institute of Educational Development (IED) an affiliated institute of AKU, Karachi that are working for the promotion of inclusive education in Pakistan and are providing training to teachers on adjustment so that all students can learn in the same class environment.

The general argument against inclusive education is that the poor economy of Pakistan will not be able to bear the financial impact of an expansive plan of inclusive education. However the most valid argument put forward in here by the NGO sector is that it is more expensive to setup separate special schools than to train existing teachers and provide learning aids for special need children in regular schools. Basic things like constructing ramps and specific classroom rearrangement geared towards the needs of special children can be accomplished within limited budget. On the other hand, interviews with policy makers and consultants working at the federal level in special education reveal that they are not convinced of the efficacy of starting inclusive education in Pakistan. They present the argument that the idea of inclusive education is alien and impractical in the Pakistani context. The fear is evident among segregated education interest groups that inclusive education may end the current special education setup. These groups are trying to protect the current special education system instead of recognizing the importance of the role that they can play in building the capacities of mainstream school administrators and educators to practice inclusive education. Some argue before the awareness in the community, training of teachers and provision of appropriate resources, it is not practical to adopt inclusive education.

Meanwhile with the efforts of NGOs, a separate ministry now has been established to meet the needs of children with special needs. The new ministry has taken some responsibilities from the Ministry of Education; however a much needed coordination policy between the two ministries needs to be worked out along with a clear agenda and strategy for the education of special children Pakistan.

#### *RATIONAL OF THE STUDY*

Pakistan is facing major developmental challenges especially in the field of Education. The Government of Pakistan has been paying attention towards education but unfortunately it cannot overcome alone on these issues.

Non-government Organizations (NGOs) in this regard are playing a vital role to help the government in this regard. A non-governmental organization (NGO) is a legally constituted organization created either by natural or legal persons. They operate independently from any government, that is why are called Non-Governmental Organizations.

There are countless national and international NGOs operating in Pakistan. All of them are striving to enforce equal rights for all in all walks of life. May it be social, developmental, Earthquake Management and Fund Raising, Drugs Demand Reduction, Health and Care, Basic and Primary Education, Sustainable Development Advocacy, Micro Credit Programs, Gender Equality; a number of NGOs have always been going out of bounds to help the common man attain equal rights.

### *PROBLEM STATEMENT*

To study issues faced by the NGOs in the implementation of the Inclusive Education Program for Disabled Children.

### *THEORITICAL FRAMEWORK*

The dependent and independent variables of this research are as follows:

#### INDEPENDENT VARIABLE

Problems faced by the NGOs

1. Less responsiveness by the related government departments for the implementation of Inclusive Education

Dimensions:

- Delayed Approval by the required departments
- Absence of liaison between the private sector (NGO) and the Government Sector (Ministry of Education and Ministry of Special Education)

2. Social Attitude of people

- Parents' Attitude
- No acceptance by the regular students and teachers

#### DEPENDENT VARIABLE

Implementation of Inclusive Education

1. Waste of funds
2. Waste of Human Resource
3. No professional development of the disabled children

## INDEPENDENT VARIABLE-PROBLEMS FACED BY THE NGOs

- Less responsiveness by the related government departments for the implementation of Inclusive Education
- *Delayed Approval by the required departments*
- *Absence of liaison between the private sector (NGO) and the Government Sector (Ministry of Education and Ministry of Special Education)*
- Social Attitude of people
- *Parents' Attitude*
- *No acceptance by the regular students and teachers*

## DEPENDENT VARIABLE-IMPLEMENTATION OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION

- Waste of funds
- Waste of Human Resource
- No professional development of the disabled children

### *HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT*

H 1: Less responsiveness by the related government departments for the implementation of Inclusive Education leads to waste of funds.

H 2: Delayed Approval by the required departments leads to waste of funds.

H 3: Absence of liaison between the private sector (NGO) and the Government Sector (Ministry of Education and Ministry of Special Education) leads to waste of funds.

H 4: No acceptance by the regular students and teachers leads to waste of funds.

H 5: Less responsiveness by the related government departments for the implementation of Inclusive Education leads to waste of human resource.

H 6: Delayed Approval by the required departments leads to waste of human resource.

H 7: Absence of liaison between the private sector (NGO) and the Government Sector (Ministry of Education and Ministry of Special Education) leads to waste of human resource.

H 8: No acceptance by the regular students and teachers leads to waste of human resource.

H 9: Less responsiveness by the related government departments for the implementation of Inclusive Education leads to no professional development of the disabled children

H 10: Delayed Approval by the required departments leads to No professional development of the disabled children.

H 11: Absence of liaison between the private sector (NGO) and the Government Sector (Ministry of Education and Ministry of Special Education) leads to no professional development of the disabled children.

H 12: No acceptance by the regular students and teachers leads to no professional development of the disabled children.

#### *OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY*

The main objectives of this study are as follows:

- To share the information and experience about the best practices of NGOs in the Inclusive Education of Disabled Children.
- To study the functioning of some of the significant NGOs of Islamabad, working in the Inclusive Education Sector.
- To identify the general problems faced by the NGOs.

- To identify the role of the NGOs in bridging the implementation plan of Government on policies and practices.
- To suggest the measures that can be initiated for Inclusive Education and Development of Disabled Children.

#### *DEFINITION OF THE TERMS*

##### Education

Education is the process by which knowledge, skills and values are transmitted from one generation to another.

Education has a formative and constructive effect on the human mind.

##### Inclusive Education

Inclusive education is the process to remove all barriers and enable all students including the excluded groups, so that they can learn and participate effectively within the regular school systems.

##### Disability

A disability is lack of either physical, mental, sensory, emotional, developmental ability or some combination of these.

##### Disabled Children

Children possessing disability; lacks of either physical, mental, sensory, emotional, developmental ability or some combination of these are referred as Disabled Children.

##### Non-Government Organization (NGO)

A non-governmental organization (NGO) is a legally constituted organization created by natural or legal persons that operates independently from any government.

## CHAPTER 2

### LITERATURE REVIEW

Education is the right of every child and it is the responsibility of the state to provide educational facilities to each and every child. "Every child has the right to education" states the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1989), cited in the National Education Policy 1998-2010. This fundamental right has been recognized in the Convention on the rights of the child (1998) stressing that "the child has the right to education and it is the duty of the state of ensure that primary education is free and compulsory." Being the signatory of the Universal Declaration of Education for all (EFA), during Hometown World Conference on Education, held in 1990, Pakistan is bound to provide educational facilities to obtain universal primary education.

The World Bank is committed to help countries achieve educational goals and objectives. Education is central to development and a key to attain Millennium Development Goals.

Education is the key to breaking the vicious cycle of poverty. Once people can read, they can vote. Once people can add and do basic math, they can run a business effectively. Education allows people to be more productive, earn better wages, protect their health and have a voice in the society. The power of education extends across generations. Children of mothers who have been to school are healthier, better nourished and more likely to attend and succeed in school than children of mothers who have never gone to school; education is one of the most effective weapons against HIV/AIDS and other diseases, and raises awareness of living conditions and environmental

protection. Life expectancy rises by as much as 2 years for every 1 per cent increase in literacy. The 1990 Conference on Education for All pledged to achieve universal primary education by 2000. (Ensuring Full Primary Education for All Children, Centre of Environmental Education, India).

Inclusive Education advocates that all children should be educated together, regardless of ability. Children with disabilities and/or special needs have the right to receive schooling in mainstream schools along with their same age peers. Inclusive Education recognizes that all children can learn and that teaching must cater to the individual strengths and needs in order for students to meet their full potential. All children must benefit from Inclusive Education. Inclusive teachers are good teachers because of their ability to use a wide variety of teaching and assessment methods. The advantages of Inclusive Education go beyond just academics, and also benefit children socially by teaching them responsibility, tolerance, and cooperation skills. (Debbie Kramarroy, PAIE).

The most important reason for Inclusive Education is that it is the basic human right for all children to receive education. Providing education for all children in one educational system has educational, social and economical advantages. As stated in the Salamanca Statement, United Nations, 1994, "Regular schools with this inclusive orientation are the most effective means of combating discriminatory attitudes, creating welcoming communities, building an inclusive society and achieving education for all; moreover, they provide an effective education to all the majority of children and improve the efficiency and ultimately the cost-effectiveness of the entire education system."

Education is a weapon, whose effect depends on who holds it in his hands and at whom it is aimed. (Joseph Stalin).

The biggest problem of poverty, besides the lack of food is the lack of power directly related to a lack of knowledge. Worldwide almost 1 billion people lack a basic skill to acquire knowledge: they are illiterate. They are illiterate because they have had no primary education or because quality of their primary education was too low. (The World Development Report 2000/2001).

According to the World Education Forum, Dakar, Senegal, (26-28 April 2000), Education is a fundamental human right. It is the key to sustainable development and peace and stability within and among countries, and thus an indispensable means for effective participation in the societies and economies of the twenty-first century, which are affected by rapid globalization. Achieving EFA goals should be postponed no longer. The basic learning needs of all can and must be met as a matter of urgency.

Nations have recently been led to borrow billions for war; no nation has ever borrowed largely for education. Probably, no nation is rich enough to pay for both war and civilization. We must make our choice; we cannot have both. (Abraham Flexner)

"Everyone deserves the best start in life, which is what UNICEF is working to provide the world's most vulnerable children. Education is essential to a child's development. I hope that as an Ambassador I can encourage people to join UNICEF's mission to make education a reality for children throughout the world."

(Clay Aiken)

"There is only one Education, and it has only one goal: the freedom of the mind. Anything that needs an adjective, be it civics education, or socialist education, or Christian education, or whatever-you-like education, is not education, and it has some different goal. The very existence of modified "educations" is testimony to the fact that their proponents cannot bring about what they want in a mind that is free. An "education" that cannot do its work in a free mind, and so must "teach" by homily and precept in the service of these feelings and attitudes and beliefs rather than those, is pure and unmistakable tyranny." (Richard Mitchell, The Underground Grammarian, September 1982)

According to the UN Director General, Kofi Annan, "Literacy unlocks the door to learning throughout life, is essential to development and health, and opens the way for democratic participation and active citizenship."

"The new education must be less concerned with sophistication than compassion. It must recognize the hazards of tribalism. It must teach man the most difficult lessons of all-to look at someone anywhere in the world and be able to see the image of him. The old emphasis upon superficial differences that separate peoples must give way to education for citizenship in the human community. With such an education and with such self-understanding, it is possible that some nation or people may come forward with the vital inspiration that men need no less than food. Leadership on this higher level does not require mountains of gold or thundering propaganda. It is concerned with human destiny. Human destiny is the issue. People will respond."

(Norman Cousins)

"Have you ever been at sea in a dense fog, when it seemed as if a tangible white darkness shut you in and the great ship, tense and anxious, groped her way toward the shore with plummet and sounding-line, and you waited with beating heart for something to happen? I was like that ship before my education began, only I was without compass or sounding line, and no way of knowing how near the harbor was. "Light! Give me light!" was the wordless cry of my soul, and the light of love shone on me in that very hour."

(Helen Keller)

For indigenous learners, and teachers or instructors, the Inclusive Education methodology often enhances educational effectiveness, success and learning outcomes by providing education that adheres to their own inherent perspectives, experiences and worldview. For non-indigenous students and teachers, education using such methods often has the effect of raising awareness of the individual traditions and collective experience of surrounding indigenous communities and peoples, and thereby promoting greater respect for and appreciation of the cultural realities of these communities and peoples. As an educational method, the inclusion of indigenous ways of knowing, learning, instructing, teaching and training has been viewed by many critical and postmodern scholars as important for ensuring that students/learners and teachers/instructors (whether indigenous or non-indigenous) are able to benefit from education in a culturally sensitive manner that draws upon, utilizes, promotes and enhances awareness of indigenous traditions.

(Merriam, Learning in Adulthood: A Comprehensive Guide, San Francisco: Josset-Bass,2007)

"A robust civil society is hugely important for process democratization and hearing the people's voices. NGOs now should not just deliver services, which the government should do, but move towards policy and advocacy". (Fausto Aarya De Santis)

UNICEF (2002-2005) reports that Inclusive Education will shift the responsibility for providing appropriate education as a right to all children, including children with disabilities, to the Ministry of Education; this would be the most appropriate place for design and implementation of a policy on Inclusive Education. Special schools run by Ministry of Women Development, Social Welfare and Special Education can continue providing support to children with severe disability for the time being. (Inclusive Education in Pakistan, UNICEF 2002-2005)

"20th century transferred the number of issues to its successor with regard to social sector. Perhaps among those most discussion able and dispersing one is "The Role of NGOs in the Development" particularly with regard to third world having mushroom growth largely depending upon the contribution made by the socially developed countries, which on its turn also exalted a number of issues lying under the generous contribution made, by the developed world." (Role of NGOs in Development, Paktribune Forums, 7th Nov, 2008)

"Education is a better safeguard of liberty than a standing army." (Edward Everett)

"An educational system isn't worth a great deal if it teaches young people how to make a living but doesn't teach them how to make a life." (Author Unknown)

As things appear at present, political systems, administrative dispensation, quality of governance, access to redress of grievance and violation of human rights, universalizing of economic gains and overall movement towards higher quality of life especially in the developing countries world over are the areas needing immediate attention. These become the primary concern of genuine NGOs. That speaks for the importance of the NGOs in the new order of human society. (World-wide Asian Eurasian Human Rights Forum WANGOs Annual Conference 2004)

The philosophy of Inclusive Education is not articulated, and there are no policy guidelines. In fact, the Ministry of Women Development, Social Welfare and Special Education do not play any role in the policy formulation of regular schools. Neither does it have any administrative control to implement an Inclusive Education Policy. As the title of National Policy for Persons with Disabilities indicates, by 2002 Special Education had been subsumed into a generalized policy for the disabled. Even the National Education Policy for 1998 does not include any mention of special or inclusive education.

Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) have been playing a central role in education of marginalized groups in developing countries since 1980s. They emerged as alternative providers of education against the backdrop of the State's failure to provide relevant and quality education for economically and culturally disadvantaged groups. They are assumed to have pro-poor orientation, flexibility, innovation, cost-effectiveness, and participatory approaches in their educational projects. Democratization in 1990s has been working as a further boost for role of NGOs in education sector in developing countries. Though

NGOs vary in their ideologies, strategies and geographical coverage, donor-drivenness make them as part of the global "associational revolution". NGOs are seen as symbols of social responsibility and global morality. They have long been working with project-based approach to reach the non-enrolled and dropouts from public schools with the active support of international donor agencies. (Mojibur R. Doftori, Department of Education, University of Tampere)

As to whether an NGO works closely with the United Nations through the establishment of some link or not is irrelevant for all practical purposes. What should be important lies in the fact that we do have volunteers who give their time, energy and expertise to help make the world better? Over the past 60 years, since the United Nations came into existence, NGOs have played a big role in the implementation of the peaceful objectives of this world body of nations. In fact, many believe that if the League of Nations had been blessed with the assistance of Non Governmental Organizations, it might have never disintegrated and gone into oblivion. It might have grown to become instrumental in the prevention of World War II and many other conflicts that took place around the world. (Share the World's Resources STWR, UN Journal, 2006)

"It is the mark of an educated mind to be able to entertain a thought without accepting it." (Aristotle)

"Upon the subject of education, not presuming to dictate any plan or system respecting it, I can only say that I view it as the most important subject which we as a people may be engaged in." (Abraham Lincoln)

"No man who worships education has got the best out of education....Without a gentle contempt for education no man's education is complete." (G.K. Chesterton)

## CHAPTER 3

### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Sample of the study

It was not possible for the researcher to approach to all the NGOs in Islamabad and its premises. The reason was lack of time and constraint of resources.

The population of size 40 was selected from 4 organizations in Islamabad:

1. Sightsavers International
2. PLAN International
3. CHIP
4. Department for International Development DFID

#### *Sightsavers International*

Sightsavers International has been working with the government and district education departments to help and encourage deprived children to go to school and diminish the alarming dropout rate. Recently, it has collaborated with partner NGOs and Disabled Persons Associations to provide facilities and advocacy for the government bodies to promote the concept of Inclusive Education in Pakistan.

#### *PLAN International*

PLAN International is an international NGO that has been operating in Pakistan since 1987. Its main objective is helping marginalized children to access their rights to health, education, livelihood and protection.

PLAN International is working with around 100 communities across the country, benefiting about 21,000 children.

### *CHIP*

Civil Society Human and Institutional Development Program (CHIP), a Swiss NGO has been working for more than decade in strengthening Civil Society Organizations working for the disadvantaged. CHIP has its head quarters in Islamabad and has been working for Community Development, Poverty Alleviation and Inclusive Education over the past 8 years.

### Department for International Development DFID

Department for International Development (DFID) was set up in 1997. It made fighting world poverty its top priority. Over the years, DFID has been working with Government bodies, multilateral agencies, Trade Unions, Civil Society to help remove the obstacles in education, health and development.

### Research Design

The design of the study was descriptive. It proved quite appropriate for the purpose of the study.

### Research Tools

The research tools always depend upon the nature of the research. In this study, Questionnaires, Interviews and Group Discussion were used as the research tools. They helped a lot in gaining and interpreting information easily.

The data acquired through the Questionnaires, Interviews and Group Discussions was collected and presented in the form of tables.

## CHAPTER 4

### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The concept of Inclusive Education is totally different from Special Education. Inclusive Education means to remove all barriers and enable all students including the disabled, so that they can learn and participate effectively within the regular school systems. The relatively less physically disabled children like hard on hearing, vision have the same potential and mind like the regular children. All they need is a little support and care.

In Pakistan, several NGOs are working for the rehabilitation, capacity building and development of the Disabled Children. These NGOs have been established either by individuals with disability or are multinational NGOs. NGOs provide a range of services to all who need them irrespective of gender, religion, ethnicity, race, disability or socio-cultural background. There is active coordination among them at the local level to pool their resources. NGOs have proved to be flexible, and have great potential for starting inclusive education. (Nawaz and Raza 2002)

Unfortunately in Pakistan, the disabled children have always been deprived from basic education. The idea of Inclusive Education is new in developing countries like Pakistan and still faces difficulties in being accepted as a universal concept. The private sector and the NGOs have so far been able to get this concept at least recognized by the Government of Pakistan. A lot of efforts have been and are still being made by the private national organizations and the international bodies working for social welfare.

Being a signatory to different International Conventions on the rights of the children and Education for all, Pakistan is supposed to have inclusive education system. Over the last one decade, in Pakistan, different efforts have been made by the international agencies to develop a system for inclusion of disabled children in the mainstream. However, these efforts could not materialize because of absence of any clear policy and demonstration model for the Ministry of Education in addition to the resistance from the teachers and parents of the students. Under the existing scenario, the Ministries of Social Welfare and Special Education, at federal and provincial levels, administrates the special education centres in the country. Any educational or social activity related to disabled children is considered under the jurisdiction of this ministry, while the Ministry of Education administrates the mainstream schools.

The National Policy for persons with disabilities has recognized inclusion as a key element and it paved way for new strategic options. Following which Directorate General of Special Education (DGSE), Federal Directorate of Education (FDE), & INGOs working for Inclusive Education for Disabled Children signed a tripartite arrangement to implement a 3 years (2004-2006) project titled "Piloting an approach for social inclusion in Islamabad". The aim of the project was to strengthen the social inclusion processes in education & mobility through capacity building of the service providers. Thus, focus of the project is improved understanding of inclusion by DGSE and requisite capacity support to FDE that could expand opportunities & avenues for inclusive education in selected schools.

## Key findings

On the basis of interviews, questionnaires and group discussions with the concerned persons in the selected NGOs and visits to the Inclusive Education Schools, following findings have been determined.

### Difference between Special Education and Inclusive Education

In recent times, where the term for Special Children has been replaced by Children with Disabilities, the concept of Special Schools has also been replaced by Inclusive Education Schools. This concept states that Children with Disabilities have all the intellect and right to study with regular students in the mainstream schools. Only the mentally challenged and the ones facing severe physical disabilities should go to the Special Schools.

A special school is the one catering students having special educational needs. These needs are due to severe learning difficulties, physical disabilities or behavioral problems. Special schools are specifically designed, staffed and resourced to provide the appropriate education for children with special needs. Special schools provide individualized education to the students in a way that the student and teacher ratio is kept low, in order to provide individualized attention to the special students.

The Inclusive Education Schools in Islamabad have enrolled children whose extra physical needs can be overcome with a little attention and a little extra time. These children are mostly the ones who are low visioned, hard on hearing or need support such as wheel chair or stick to walk.

By interviewing the concerned people, it has been found out that unfortunately in Pakistan, no such initiative has been taken on the above mentioned grounds. The NGOs and the private sector have always been playing a stand alone role to implement the "Education for All" concept. Though now, through their countless efforts, the Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education has launched a new policy on persons with disability whose cornerstone is inclusion. At around the same time, initiatives are underway in the Directorate General of Special Education to promote inclusive education.

#### Role of Government in the Inclusive Education

- The basic problem behind the slow implementation of Inclusive Education for the Disabled Children is Government's negligence. At the Federal level, the implications for Inclusive Education have been recognized in principle but they still have not been fully incorporated in practice by the Government.
- There exists lack of coordination between the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education for meeting the needs of children with disabilities and those belonging to other marginalized groups.
- The National Policy on Disability now clearly endorses inclusive education as the best mode of education for children with disability. The NGOs through international and local funding have invested heavily in developing Inclusive Education program schools in Islamabad. All the capital items that were procured and the refurbishments made were with the ownership of the Government of Pakistan.

Annual provisions have been made in the budgets for their repair and maintenance.

- On the part of the Ministry of Education, and FDE, there is still a need of demonstrated commitment, ownership and enthusiasm to make inclusive education a reality and routine.

#### The functioning of Inclusive Education Schools in Islamabad

Through continuous efforts of the NGOs working for Inclusive Education, the National Policy for persons with disabilities has recognized inclusion as a key element and has paved way for new strategic options. Following which Directorate General of Special Education (DGSE), Federal Directorate of Education (FDE), and INGO Sightsavers International (Islamabad) signed a tripartite arrangement to implement a 3 years (2004-2006) project titled "Piloting an approach for social inclusion in Islamabad". The aim of the project has been to strengthen the social inclusion processes in education & mobility through capacity building of the service providers. Thus, focus of the project has been on an improved understanding of inclusion by DGSE and requisite capacity support to FDE that could expand opportunities and avenues for inclusive education in selected schools.

The milestones achieved by the NGOs in Islamabad over the few years are as follows:

- The capacity of regular schools in inclusion for disabled children has been built through training, sensitisation, resource centres and linkages with special education.

- The capacity of the Directorate of Special Education has been strengthened in facilitating the inclusion process.
- Seventeen (17) mainstream schools in Islamabad have been facilitated to provide Inclusive Education so far. This includes provision of necessary infrastructure like ramps, usability and resource labs and trained teachers.
- A permanent resource centre has been developed that is catering for the needs of the visually impaired and hard on hearing children for inclusion and training of mainstream teachers.
- The parents of the children have been motivated to enrol the students in mainstream schools through discussion and promotion of resource centres in the mainstream schools.
- Peer identification - at least 3000 children enrolled in the schools have been trained to use a special form to feedback about children with disability in their neighborhoods.
- Around 8 (eight) Parent teacher Associations (PTAs) have been trained to support community detection process.
- Over 200 school teachers have been trained on inclusion, child friendly environment and technical training related to different disabilities.

#### Social Attitude

#### Family behavior

As they say charity begins at home, the attitude of parents and siblings matter a lot in this regard. The attitude of the disabled children's parents has often been skeptical about their adjustment in the mainstream schools. With the advent and successful running of the Inclusive Education Schools in Islamabad, the attitude has taken a positive shift now. Parents

are willing to enroll their children in the mainstream schools so that the children can get education in a regular and opportunist environment.

Some parents were of the view that their children would not make adequate academic gains in an inclusive setting along with students who are used to rigorous academic routine. They were also concerned that their child would be bullied, teased and likely to be harmed. A number of meetings with the parents helped to sensitize them that their children would not only make substantial academic gains, but would also acquire social, interpersonal, and personal skills.

Different awareness programs, workshops and meetings are arranged from time to time by the NGOs to highlight the benefits being gained by them and their children by studying in the mainstream schools. Parents of disabled children who are still deprived from education are also willing to get their children enrolled in the schools.

Parent Teacher Associations (PTAs) formed through the collaboration of NGOs has also played an effective role in educating parents who questioned the academic validity of inclusive education. Some parents were of the view that their children would not make adequate academic gains in an inclusive setting along with students who are used to rigorous academic routine. They were also concerned that their child would be bullied, teased and likely to be harmed. A number of meetings with the parents helped to sensitize them that their children would not only make substantial academic gains, but would also acquire social, interpersonal, and personal skills.

Orientation of fellow regular students and teachers

The ordinary schools in Pakistan are still not open to accept the enrolment of children with disability. Major resistance comes from the teachers of such schools, who do not have the requisite skills to properly and adequately attend such students. In addition, the necessary materials and resources for persons with disability (like assistive technologies) are not available in these schools.

In this regard the pilot project of the Inclusive Education has succeeded in informing the institutional thinking and practice as both the key agencies e.g. Federal Directorate of Education FDE and Director General of Special Education DGSE now consider it a joint responsibility, and through their Memorandum of Understanding involving INGO Sight Savers International and CHIP, they have formalized their commitment to enroll students with visual impairment in ordinary schools (by FDE) with improved arrangements within the selected to facilitate the system for inclusion (by DGSE and SSI).

The capacity and attitude of both of the above mentioned has been built by sufficient training and provision of necessary infrastructure.

## CHAPTER 5

### CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### CONCLUSION

The concept of Inclusive Education still has a long way to go to be understood in Pakistan. This really is regardless of the efforts made by the non profit organizations.

Pakistan has been making progress to include disability in their poverty reduction and growth strategies. With the continuous efforts made by the NGO and private sector, the Government of Pakistan has promulgated a National Policy for Children with Disabilities. There still are issues with mind sets of Ministry of Social Welfare to understand the contexts and pretext of social protection which includes Inclusive Education.

It is underscored that advancing towards the implementation of inclusive education is not easy and quick act. A conducive and favorable transformation in the social and other (like accessibility) conditions outside the school are as important for the success of this experiment as those inside the school. Also, it must not be assumed that there is full acceptance of the inclusive philosophy by parents of ordinary children. It is observed that different disabilities, and different levels of challenge within each disability, get differing reactions, resistance and responses. There seem to be hierarchy of disabilities as well.

It may be pointed out that many mainstream educationalists and some disability-focused organizations argue for separate, 'specialist' services. For instance, organizations of deaf people tend to argue that deaf children have to be educated separately in order to guarantee their right to education in the medium of sign language and access to deaf culture.

To conclude this debate, I would say that in Islamabad a bridging arrangement - on the lines of this pilot project - would offer an effective road towards inclusive education. Secondly, to counter the apprehensions of those who think specialist provision is better, I would say that such pupils could find ample time and opportunities outside the school, and at the transit facility, to be firmly part of their community culture. The dividends of inclusive education are clear and obvious. The specialist, separatist provision would reinforce stigmas and exclusion.

## Recommendations

Based on the research work, visit to the NGOs, Inclusive Education Schools, Interviews and Discussion with the concerned personnel, the following are the recommendations that can help to decrease the issues faced by the NGOs in the Inclusive Education of Disabled Children.

1. The Non Government Organizations are the flag bearers in promoting and implementing inclusive education for the

disabled children but face problems in doing so. There is a dire need to support their efforts by providing grants from the government and international donor agencies.

2. It has to be recognized that providing education to the disabled children in mainstream inclusive schools rather than establishing special schools is less costly. The additional or marginal cost to transform mainstream schools to inclusive ones is minimal and quite less and affordable for the government.
3. A national policy formulation on the implementation of Inclusive Education is essential to establish the system in Pakistan. It has to be realized that an inclusive education system benefits children from all groups in society, and not just the disabled.
4. An improved coordination and collaboration between the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education is necessary.
5. Government legislation should be passed so that it becomes compulsory for every public school to admit all children irrespective of their special needs. However, severely mentally retarded children or severely physical handicapped children may be referred to a special school.
6. Clergy has always played a prominent role in Pakistan. They can be used to change the mindset of people towards disability and Inclusive Education. The fair and equitable teachings of Islam will surely have an exceptional effect in the successful implementation of Inclusive Education.

7. Media should be used a platform to prepare proactive perceptions for the society including parents. Various organizations managing and presenting dramas and cultural events can also be involved in this regard.
8. A detailed and in-depth research is required on a regular basis to investigate the constraints and difficulties faced time to time in implementing inclusive practices in Pakistan.
9. The education policy of the government should be revised in such a way that a clear agenda is set out for developing a practical and cost-effective way of meeting the needs of all children.
10. Orientation and awareness sessions should be given to all sections of the Ministry of Education. This will assist them in developing a layout for inclusion of children with special needs according to the international standards.
11. The Ministry of special education should be assigned the task of training teachers working in inclusive schools through short training courses, seminars and workshops.
12. The international donor agencies of the social development projects should provide financial and technical support to the Government and the NGOs and the private sector. Steps should be taken for the promotion of inclusive education as a first priority.

13. Changes have to be made in the current teaching methodologies so that all children including the ones with disabilities can be benefited.
14. The attitude of the teachers and fellow students can be made better through awareness programs and sessions.
15. Private schools funded should be asked by the Ministry of Education to start Inclusive Education program as well.